

**Graduate School
Social and Political Science
Dissertation Cover Sheet**

Please enter your Examination Number and Dissertation Title into the following grid and insert this form on to the front of your dissertation before uploading to ELMA.

Exam Number	B057522
Dissertation Title	The Opportunities and Challenges to Finding Employment for Youth in Maasai Mara, Kenya
Programme of Study	MSc Africa and International Development 2014/2015
Word Count	Dissertation: 14,983 Diaries: 2,996

The Opportunities and Challenges in Finding Employment for Youth in Maasai Mara, Kenya

Exam Number: B057522



MSC AFRICA & INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT 2014/2015

Word Count: 14,983

Field Diaries: 2,996

ABSTRACT

The Maasai of southern Kenya face numerous challenges from living alongside wildlife. As conservation initiatives and tourism operators work to preserve this valuable ecosystem, local people bear the costs of livestock predation, crop and property destruction, and occasional human injury. Non-governmental organisations have emerged to try to bring benefits to these communities in order to prevent further human-wildlife conflict. In cooperation with Olare Orok and Motorogi Trust, this research has focused on the issue of youth (ages 16-34) unemployment in the Maasai Mara. Pastoralism remains the primary livelihood activity in the Mara, but many Maasai youth desire employment. Through semi-structured interviews and focus groups with a variety of stakeholders, including employers, community members and youth, this research highlights the challenges faced with regards to employment across the former Koiyaki Group Ranch area. This research found that the most prominent challenges are structural limitations in access to education. Employment opportunities also remain decisively gendered. Furthermore, ethnicity and kinship create a political economy of employment where benefits are consolidated into the hands of a few. This paper explores these issues and situates these obstacles within an area experiencing rapid transformation with respect to land use and economic activities.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation would not have been possible without a great deal of support. First, I would like to extend a thank you to Dr. Zoe Marks, my supervisor, whose patience, forthright honesty, and thorough guidance greatly improved the quality of this work. Her ability to bring my scattered ideas and notions into focus allowed my work to flourish. I would also like to thank the University of Edinburgh and the Global Development Academy for providing me with the necessary funds and support to travel for my research.

My undying gratitude goes to Dr. Crystal Courtney, my placement supervisor and graduate of the Centre for African Studies. In many ways, her extensive knowledge of the Maasai Mara area enabled me to hit the ground running with a deep understanding of the community's situation. Although I was careful to observe from my own perspective as well, the information she gave me was corroborated repeatedly. I extend my deepest thanks, Nalangu.

Thank you to my parents whose unrelenting encouragement and frequent assistance in proofreading was an invaluable asset. Thank you also to my classmates for providing me with laughs, moral support, coffee breaks and proofreading help when I wanted to give up, or worse, when I thought I might never finish.

Lastly, and most importantly, I would like to thank the communities who shared their stories and experiences with me. Their ideas and their willingness to sit and explain to me in great detail their challenges and aspirations is the basis for this entire work. My co-researcher, Maatany Ntimama, who also acted as my interpreter, was immensely helpful in connecting me with people across the Mara, and tolerated my insistence at delving into the minutiae and allowed me to press points for clarification. The other staff at the Trust, Resian, Marias, Jonathan, James, David, and Danson were amply generous in their time and welcomed me wholeheartedly into their lives. *Ashe oleng!*

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1 Introduction.....	1
CHAPTER 3 Pastoralism, Ethnicity, and Education.....	8
CHAPTER 4 Gender Implications of Maasai Livelihood Diversification.....	16
CHAPTER 5 Wage Labour and the Political Economy of Employment.....	27
CHAPTER 6 Moving Forward.....	36
Bibliography.....	39
Appendix A Interview Cited in Text	44
Appendix B Focus Groups	45

CHAPTER 1 Introduction

Tourism is one of Kenya's largest foreign exchange earners, contributing 10 percent to both national GDP and total employment, thereby providing significant potential to contribute toward economic development (Manyara et al 2007). Approximately half of all international tourists in Kenya visit the Maasai Mara, however this remains one of the country's poorer areas, and 50 to 60 percent of the local people live below the global poverty line (KCBS 2003).

Wildlife tourism has been promoted by the World Bank and by development organisations as a means of generating revenue to produce sustainable development in the Global South while at the same time promoting conservation strategies and ideologies that emerge largely from the Global North (Duffy 2006; Manyara et al 2007). As local residents are the ones most likely to bear the costs from living alongside wildlife, efforts have been made to try to bring benefits to these people in order to reduce human-wildlife conflict (Chatty and Colchester 2002). Both theoretical literature and empirical studies from sub-Saharan Africa have supported the idea that wildlife conservation is not likely to succeed without an increased emphasis on community participation (Thompson et al 2002; Schroeder 2000: 340).

The field research for this dissertation was undertaken in Maasai Mara, southern Kenya, in cooperation with the Olare Orok and Motorogi Trust (hereafter referred to simply as 'the Trust'). The Maasai Mara comprises the northern part of the Serengeti-Mara ecosystem, an area that is considered the pinnacle of the 'pristine African wilderness' imagery that dominates tourist brochures and National Geographic documentaries (Neumann 1998: 10). The Trust functions as the development arm of a private-public partnership between conservancies, tourism operators, and local landowners. The intersections of conservation, development, tourism, and local people are at the heart of this dissertation, thereby making the Trust an ideal site for examining these intersections.

1.1 Research Questions

As one of the largest revenue generators in Maasai Mara, tourism is a crucial potential source of funds for both conservation and development. Tourism camps claim to value employing ‘local Maasai’, in order to provide benefits and incentives to local communities to conserve wildlife, but there is a wide variability in how many local people camps employ and how wide an area they consider to be local (Courtney 2015: 213). Additionally, there are fewer opportunities for employment outside the tourism sector in the Mara, especially for those who are uneducated, and these positions range in desirability.

In order to help create skills training programmes for unemployed youth (ages 16-34), the Trust proposed that I undertake research to address the following questions:

1. What challenges do Maasai youth face in securing employment?
2. What kinds of skills do Maasai youth desire?
3. How do opportunities and barriers vary between genders?

These questions will be explored in the following chapters. The remainder of Chapter 1 will describe the motivation for the research, define a few key terms, and briefly state the methodologies used.

1.2 Research Motivation

In the 1980s, the fear of land appropriation brought about the subdivision of group ranches in Kenya into private, individually held allotments that were intended to formalise the Maasai’s rights to land (Bedelian 2013). For Koiyaki Group Ranch, where this study took place, the process was rife with allegations of corruption. Wealthy and powerful elites were accused of capturing the most fertile parts and the ones with the most business potential (ibid).

During subdivision, only individuals previously on the group ranch registers were supposed to attain land title. This effectively dispossessed women and youth from land ownership, as only men had been registered before (ibid). The exclusion of youth was a large part of the motivation for this research on unemployment. Currently, the only way the Maasai youth can get land is through the patrilineal system of inheritance or through purchase. The latter is not possible for the majority, because they are unemployed.

1.3 Defining Pastoralist Development

The definition of pastoralism has been subject to much debate, because various internal and external influences have pushed pastoralists into other livelihood pursuits across East Africa (Spear 1993). Pastoralism constitutes multiple modes of production and relies to varying extents on herding livestock and other strategies such as agriculture, trade, and wage labour. I have decided to borrow from Hodgson's (2000: 6) use of the term 'pastoralist' to refer to those for whom pastoralism 'is an ideal, if not a reality'. Pastoralists are not a homogenous entity, but I have chosen to use a sufficiently broad definition to capture those who may be temporarily engaged in only non-pastoral activities but who have the intent to re-enter pastoralism in the future (Fratkin 2013).

I am also influenced by Courtney's (2015) study of sustainable development in nearly the same study site, where she used a participatory approach to explore local definitions of 'development'. In keeping with her findings, I have framed my thinking around three development indicators – meeting basic needs, livelihood security in terms of livestock and pastoralism, and economic implications (ibid). By using these locally situated definitions of development, I hope to offer a more grounded analysis of this particular context.

In international development research, the study of relationships between formal and informal economies, and those who engage in informal economies, has allowed us to better understand how economies function in areas with little central government presence (Hart 1973). Throughout this dissertation, I use 'employment' to capture both formal, salaried positions as well as informal, wage labour or entrepreneurial activities. It is important to recognise that pastoral livestock herding and accumulation is still the primary livelihood activity in the area. It makes valuable contributions to households and the sale of livestock is vital for both local and national economies (Catley et al 2013). I do not differentiate between formal and informal employment, however, because the participants themselves used the Kiswahili words, *kazi* (lit. 'work') and *biashara* (lit. 'business') to refer to both types of opportunities and I did not want to (re)produce a Western dichotomy.

In order to appropriately convey the relationships between different players in this story, I use the term 'translocal' to refer to development institutions and foreign-operated

tourism camps and their employees. These actors and sites represent entities that are distinctly globally interconnected and traverse beyond national boundaries, but are also locally situated (Griener et al 2013). The flows of international tourists, mobile and internet communications technologies, and global discourses and values around wildlife conservation are part of open and evolving processes that are also socially embedded in specific ways, hence the use of ‘translocal’.

1.4 Methodology

This field research was conducted over the course of eight weeks from May-June 2015 in partnership with the Olare Orok and Motorogi Trust. The empirical data gathered is a result of semi-structured interviews with 33 individuals and 5 focus groups (FG) with over 50 individuals. All interviews were conducted across the former Koiyaki Group Ranch area, the Trust’s operating area. The research was clustered around the local town centres – Aitong to the North, Talek to the South, and Olesere to the East – with rural villages visited for comparative purposes, including Mbitin, Olkoroto, and Nkoilale.

Chapter 2 is a modified version of the field diaries I wrote while completing my empirical research and uses ethnographic examples to comment on issues of gender, positionality, and the nature of development projects. Chapter 3 describes how historical interventions have linked Maasai identity to herding and the ways formal education has impacted pastoralist livelihood strategies. Chapters 4 and 5 address ways in which pastoralist divisions of labour and social norms transfer onto new capitalist forms of work with regard to gender and ethnicity. Finally, in chapter 6, I synthesise these arguments to present a series of recommendations to the Trust in designing their skills training programme.

CHAPTER 3 Pastoralism, Ethnicity and Education: Historical Perspectives and Contemporary Challenges

In 2013, Kenya ranked 147th out of 187 countries on the UN's Human Development Index (UNDP 2014). Kenya is classified as having low human development, but its wealth and access to institutions such as health clinics and schools is highly differentiated geographically and across classes, with pastoral areas being some of the most marginalised (Fratkin 2001; UNDP 2014). The reasons East African pastoral areas have followed certain development pathways lie partially in colonial and postcolonial official policies (Spencer 1998; Fratkin 2013). Pastoral areas, often lying along national borders and in arid or semi-arid lands unsuitable for farming, are far from capital cities and the state, and beyond the reach of many development institutions (Catley et al 2013).

Any study of poverty and pastoralism requires situating circumstances within specific time periods and spaces, while also investigating the socio-historical processes that have led to such conditions (Waller 1999). Being able to analyse contemporary processes of livelihoods diversification and employment opportunities in Maasai Mara necessitates an understanding of previous diversification strategies and the influence of external actors. First, this chapter discusses the ways in which Maasai ethnicity and identity became linked with pastoralism through a series of events during the 19th and early 20th centuries. Second, I analyse the extent to which pastoralism remains an important part of livelihood strategies in Maasai Mara today in contrast to other regions of Maasailand. Third, I explain how colonial practices and the introduction of formal educational systems during the mid 20th century had a significant impact on the way Maasai viewed both themselves and other non-Maasai vis-à-vis livelihoods strategies. Lastly, I analyse the current challenges affecting employment rates and how structural inequality affects access to education opportunities in Maasai Mara.

3.1 Maasai Identity and Pastoralism

The Maasai are one of the most recognisable pastoralist groups across Africa, in part due to their reputation for defending their livelihood against institutions that try to

force them into being sedentary agriculturalists (Spear 1993). Despite the strong associations between Maasai and pastoralism, Spear (1993) argues that the Maasai have only practised pure pastoralism during the past few centuries. Far from being an ‘ancient’ practice, the Maasai solidified their identity as livestock herders during the 19th century as they competed with other agricultural, hunter-gatherer, and fishing societies for resources (ibid). As cattle became a symbol of prosperity, the Maasai came to identify closely as herders and they cast off other Maa-speaking groups that pursued different livelihoods (ibid).

In the 1890s, rinderpest epidemics, intersectional warfare amongst clans, and competition from colonizers over ranching land gradually and increasingly marginalised the Maasai (Waller 1999). As a result, the Maasai were pushed toward less productive land on the border of Kenya and Tanzania. Combined with the colonizers’ own familiarity with agricultural activities, farmers were given preference in allocating assistance and the Maasai came to be viewed as rich, but ‘lazy’ (ibid). Colonizers thought the accumulation of livestock was unproductive and thus sought to make Maasai into farmers (ibid).

The image of the solitary Maasai herder, cloaked in red cloths, carrying a stick as he leads his cattle across the highlands has persisted since colonial times and has continually been seen as needing ‘modernisation’ (Hodgson 2001). As writer Elspeth Huxley depicted on her journeys through colonial era Kenya, ‘these obstinately conservative nomads, wandering with their enormous herds from pasture to pasture, seem like dinosaurs or pterodactyls, survivors from a past age with a dying set of values’ (Huxley 1948: 89). The Maasai are often represented as either valiant and intrepid warriors whose culture is at risk of being lost for eternity, or as backward primitive people who need to catch up with the rest of ‘civilised’ Africans (Spencer 1998; Hodgson 2001). Hodgson (1999a) has argued that these characterisations still influence the types of projects development organisations implement and how resources are channelled.

During the transition to independence, African governments and aid agencies assumed that colonial era policies on pastoralism had failed because they were products of colonialism rather than re-examining their assumptions about pastoral livelihoods and economies (Spencer 1998). They continued the same earlier approaches, instead of

questioning how they formulated pastoralist ‘problems’ and designed solutions (Hodgson 2001: 221). By the 1980s, the World Bank and the US Agency for International Development had invested over \$1 billion in efforts to ‘modernise’ pastoralists, but the East African pastoral sector was faring worse than ever (Fratkin 2001). Such outcomes have sparked increased need for research around how pastoralism fits into contemporary economies, an issue I examine in Chapter 5 (Catley et al 2013).

3.2 Pastoralism in Maasai Mara

Pastoralism remains a central part of identity to the Maasai in the study area (Courtney 2015). Although a few notable exceptions exist, most people state that they always wish to remain with their livestock. As one respondent told me, ‘Most of the people in the Mara, if you are not working, you can keep livestock anyway’ (Male Adult 1). Pastoralism provides a safety net as people attempt to navigate new economies and different livelihood activities.

For many participants, their interests in skills training included concerns over upgrading knowledge around livestock. Many participants mentioned during interviews that they would like youth to have veterinary skills due to the large number of livestock in the area. They also expressed that people would appreciate having knowledge of better cattle and rangeland management strategies (Male Adult 1; Male University Student 1). Several highly educated men suggested that youth should learn more about manufacturing meat products and upgrading breeds, as many people have livestock but do not know how to add value to it (Male University Student 2; Focus Group 3; Clinic Staff 3). As a Koiyaki Guiding School teacher told me, ‘You cannot advise the Maasai community to do away with the livestock. What they have done forever. But you can ask them, advise them to deal with managing stock and things like that. Because after all, what they’re doing with tourism is experimental. But what they are doing with livestock is a livelihood.’ (Male Teacher 2). Skills training programmes are more likely to be adopted by these communities if they incorporate elements that support and strengthen pastoralist practices, and if they provide stability and resilience amidst a volatile tourism economy.

While the Maasai of Kajiado District in Kenya have largely begun to enter into farming practices (Wangui 2014), the Maasai of Narok District have not. Given the amount of attention devoted to the future of pastoralism and the diversification of Maasai into agriculture as a potential ‘exit’ out of pastoralism (Catley et al 2013), I think it is also interesting to look at areas where this strategy is not being pursued and the reasons why pastoralism largely persists. Tourism provides the most readily available income opportunities after livestock. Data gathered in 2004 showed that approximately 50 percent of households earn income from wildlife tourism, creating a desire for tourism jobs (Homewood et al 2006; Thompson et al 2009). As tourism remains one of the only industries compatible with wildlife, there are a limited number of ways in which Maasai can diversify their livelihood, so pastoralism continues to feature prominently in their strategies.

3.3 History of Education Interventions in Maasailand

In addition to the shifting land use and livelihood strategies mentioned in section 3.1, historical interventions have also had a significant impact on pastoralism and identity with regard to formal education in Maasailand. Under British colonialism, the Maasai were forced to send one son to a Native Authority school in the district headquarters (Hodgson 2001: 140). While the British used this to organise what they saw as ‘chaotic tribes’, the Maasai were reluctant to send their children to these schools, for fear they would become an *ormeek* (Hodgson 1999b). *Ormeek* was a derogatory term used to refer to Africans who were educated, wore trousers, worked in the government, or were Christian (ibid). In part a product of interactions with colonialism, Maasai had come to identify their ethnicity in opposition to these ‘Swahili’ agricultural people who complied with colonizers (Spear 1993). Most importantly though, an *ormeek* was ignorant of how to care for cattle and had no home or community, thus making him no longer Maasai (Hodgson 1999b).

Although the Maasai who came to these schools were often viewed by colonial administrators as naturally bright, many young Maasai struggled with attending boarding schools away from their livestock and their usual diet of meat, blood, and milk (Huxley

1948: 96). The boarding schools were designed to keep them away from their peers who might pressure them to drop out (Hodgson 2001). As these first students graduated and began to hold government seats, their knowledge of Kiswahili, the national language, allowed them to voice issues of land rights and exclusion that they had never been able to before. Previously, Maasai were steadfastly opposed to Western education (Fratkin 2013). Their stance began to shift upon realisation that formal education could enable them to influence policies in their favour by increasing their bargaining power at the state level (Hodgson 2011).

Today, pastoralists make trade-offs to balance their need for household labour with their desire to send their children to school. As more children attend school, this crucial labour element is lost in the hope that having an educated child, in the long-term, will be more advantageous than losing labour and having a smaller herd in the short term (Hodgson 2011). The Maasai place a high value on education though, often making economic sacrifices in order to send their children to school. In her long-term ethnographic work on Tanzanian Maasai, Hodgson (2011: 185) found that people today no longer want to be 'blind' or 'ignorant' by not sending their children to school.

3.4 Structural Barriers to Educational

During interviews, many participants said that the previous generation was unaware of the importance of education. Now, however, people stress that education can take you anywhere (Male Village Elder). When asked about the challenges youth face in finding employment, the nearly ubiquitous response was that a lack of education prevented people from getting the jobs they desire. Basic literacy was by far the biggest component of how they perceived education, followed by needing foreign language skills in order to work in the tourism industry. Many also stressed the need for official documents to show employers, such as report cards from the Kenya Certificate of Secondary Education (KCSE) exam.

Despite the importance Maasai place on education, the youth face many barriers to even completing primary school. Although the Kenyan government has mandated free, universal primary education, it has not been implemented evenly across the country (Sifuna 2007). It is also not entirely 'free', as parents are still forced to pay fees for

supplies, as many schools are boarding schools. Parents must also pay salaries for teachers at some schools, because the government never sends enough to Narok County, the county in which this study took place (Female Teacher 3). In order to keep class sizes manageable, parents are forced to hire the remaining teachers needed (ibid). At Olesere School, Head Teacher Irene said that a year ago, she had only two teachers for the entire school of 500 students (Female Teacher 1).

A lack of quality teachers in this rural area forces parents to hire teachers who may not have completed primary school themselves (Trust CEO). The area also lacks enough schools at all levels, forcing young students to travel long distances past dangerous wildlife and making university or even secondary school out of reach for many (Camp Staff 1; Clinic Staff 2; FG 4). At the time of the study, only one secondary school was open¹, Maasai Mara Secondary School in Aitong, where the total enrolment was 161 boys and 16 girls.

The gender ratio is highly skewed because female students face additional barriers in completing school. Many participants said that girls are held back by their fathers or drop out because of early or forced marriages and pregnancy (CDW 2; Female Teacher 2; FG 4; Male Teacher 1). In some primary schools, there is not a single girl finishing Standard 8 (CDW 1). Primary enrolment in Narok County is lower than the national Kenya average, especially for girls (EPDC 2007). However, Narok County well exceeds the national average for percentage of schools achieving passing exam scores (ibid). Despite low enrolment, poor quality teachers, poor student to teacher ratios, and lack of quality infrastructure, students still manage to be successful. For youth who do have access to school, there is clearly an incentive to perform well.

During interviews, people expressed a slight contradiction in their attitudes toward education and employment. According to many participants, young people did not see the value in school, because they could easily earn tips by singing and dancing for tourists, or procuring unskilled positions as security guards or cleaners at camps (Female Teacher 1; Female Teacher 3; FG 4; Trust CEO). Education is important, but is not a

¹ A secondary school in Talek was nearly done being built during my research, but construction was proceeding slowly and it will likely be longer until teachers are hired and classrooms filled with desks, supplies and students.

limitation to earning income from wage labour. The broader social effects of the tourism industry on employment opportunities are a critical element of the Maasai Mara context and Chapter 5 is devoted largely to this topic. It is worth noting here though that structural inequalities which limit educational access have real effects on the types of employment youth desire and ultimately can attain.

Despite the importance placed on education across the study site and throughout different age-sets, several studies have found that education levels were not significant as a predictor of income in similar study sites (Homewood et al 2006; Little et al 2008). Furthermore, education can pull youth into urban areas to join the formal workforce, either providing stability during shocks or removing valuable labour contributions (Fratkin 2013). When planning a skills training programme, it thus becomes important to look beyond formal education toward other tools that enable Maasai to find work that is available locally and compatible with pastoral livelihoods. Several highly educated men told me that people in the area were going for professional positions, but as one told me, ‘You can see the technician is still working much better, more longer, more stronger than a professional’ (Male Adult 1). Many participants stressed that the Maasai Mara really needs a technical college or vocational school.

Given the importance of pastoralism to Maasai identity and livelihoods strategies in Mara, any intervention must also take into account how new activities can coexist with pastoralist ones. Historically, Maasai identity has been linked closely with pastoralism through a number of external factors that made herding the most suitable livelihood choice. Formal education interventions have modified the choices Maasai have made with regard to balancing household labour. The Maasai are a small population compared to other Kenyan ethnic groups and an educated faction strengthens their negotiating power with state institutions and foreign development organisations. Education affords Maasai upward social mobility and higher incomes, but impacts their activities as herders. Amidst uneven development patterns across Kenya, pastoralists face external pressures that limit herding, pushing them toward new economic activities. As a result, they try to balance their desire to maintain pastoralist strategies with employment opportunities that require higher education.

CHAPTER 4: Gender Implications of Maasai Livelihood Diversification

‘You know that’s another big problem with Maasai people. Maasai men don’t want to get tired. Because you know the women clean the house, fetch the water, firewoods, cook. So the Maasai men treat themselves like small kings without crowns’ – Camp Manager 2

During a memorial celebration held at the Trust’s headquarters, a camp manager politely asked me how my research was progressing and how I was enjoying living at the conservancy base. I responded that things were going well, but that it was ‘kind of a man’s world’ at our living compound where I was one of two women living with eleven men and a dozen more at a neighbouring site. He laughed and replied, ‘Welcome to the Mara’.

Even in this simple exchange of pleasantries, we made evident the perceived gender divisions of Maasai Mara, so often viewed as ‘a man’s society’ (Hodgson 2000: 15). By extrapolating from my observation about this single site to the area more broadly, these gender divisions were also taken for granted. When development organisations or non-Maasai outsiders view Maasai gender configurations as clinging to an historical mode of patriarchy and male domination, certain patterns are reproduced that can serve to perpetuate the marginalisation of women (Hodgson 1999b). Current Maasai gender configurations are not particularly historical nor are they indigenously African. Gender roles and relations in all contexts are dynamic and contested, produced through the actions of women and men, and influenced by translocal institutions (Hodgson 2000).

For Maasai women, their experiences with development are diverse and they embrace it in a variety of ways² (Hodgson 2001). Many people I spoke to recognised the rapid changes that women’s lives were undergoing – in terms of their access to schooling, employment, and income-earning opportunities – as a result of development interventions. However, they also readily admitted to the challenges that remain that are specific to women. In the opening of this chapter, a Maasai man describes how women have much potential to work in tourism camps because, unlike men, they are accustomed to the physical labour of household chores. He encourages women to seek out these

² I recognise that it is important to focus on the activities of both women and men in a gender analysis (Hodgson 1999b), but women will be given primary focus as the increase in educated women and the number of development projects focussing on women have created changes that warrant further exploration.

positions. Yet most camps employ very few, if any, women. These camps and new tourism markets are embedded into Maasai culture in ways that uphold patriarchal configurations. As men adapt to these new economic opportunities, women attempt to manoeuvre within the limited spaces that they can.

This chapter examines the conflicting perceptions around women's income earning activities and their potential. It illustrates some of the shifts in gender relations underlying the rate of change – through development programmes and economic development – for women's lives in the Mara. Historical outside interventions privileged Maasai men and men's activities over women, ignoring the important contributions women made to the pastoralist households and economy (Talle 1987; Talle 1988; Hodgson 1999b). In the contemporary context, externally motivated, private businesses and development organisations continue to privilege men and men's activities in ways similar to missionaries and colonizers.

In this chapter, I first discuss the effects of historical interventions on Maasai gender relations. Second, I discuss the patriarchal structure of Maasai society and the difficulties I encountered in attempting to research employment opportunities for all youth. Third, I describe the nature of the employment opportunities available to Maasai women in the study area and the ways in which formal employment trends continue to restrict women to the 'domestic' and 'household' spaces. Fourth, I examine the effects of women's participation in markets and microeconomic activities on the household and on gender relations. Lastly, I argue that the goals of the Trust in creating a skills training programme for youth have unintended gendered consequences as they follow the type of work in demand and the perceptions of what is socially acceptable as women's work.

4.1 Effects of Historical Interventions of Gender Relations

The effects of colonial powers and development institutions have not only impacted land use and livelihood strategies, but also Maasai gender relations. Dorothy Hodgson's (1999b, 1999c, 2000, 2001, 2011) extensive ethnographic work on Maasai, gender, and ethnicity convincingly portrays the process by which ambivalent attitudes of missionaries and colonizers toward Maasai culture actively consolidated political and economic power into the hands of men. These external actors forged a link between

Maasai ethnicity and three predominantly male pursuits - cattle herding, nomadism and warriorhood. By privileging this dominant masculinity, outsiders effectively equated being Maasai with being a man and thus designed interventions to assist men (Hodgson 1999b). Women were excluded almost entirely from retaining their identity as pastoralists and were pushed to the devalued domestic domain. The patriarchal structure of Maasai society that exists today is in part a product of these interactions (Brockington 2004).

In Aud Talle's (1987) work on Maasai women in the household, she argues that women in fact enjoyed a greater deal of autonomy prior to colonisation. In spite of the patriarchal organisation of Maasai society previously, women held significant roles within the pastoral subsistence economy. They held an important position as traders with non-pastoral people, travelling to towns to sell small stock, and acquire metal, cloth, and crucial grains for the dry season (Spencer 1998: 9). Women also played a mediating role in livestock transactions, and although they could never fully own animals, they had total control over distributing milk. When missionaries and colonizers entered Maasailand, the role women played in taking care of livestock was less visible to them, because women generally interacted with animals only while close to the homestead (Talle 1987). As commercial markets came to replace the Maasai household as a system of social and economic organisation, livestock became increasingly commoditized and men assumed greater power over all livestock, while women's role within production diminished (ibid). The distribution of formerly communal land into the hands of individual males and the current push toward commercial ranching has perpetuated these gender relations today as outsiders have continued to design interventions without considering the effects on women (Kipuri et al 2008; Hodgson 2011).

4.2 The Patriarchal Structure of Maasai Society

Despite rapid change and external pressures, the Maasai people of this study area are firmly patriarchal in many ways (Wangui 2014). Women now attend and speak more often at community meetings when historically they were not allowed before. However, men must still speak first or else a woman will be socially sanctioned and sometimes physically reprimanded (Courtney 2015: 114). Because inheritance is patrilineal, falling to the eldest son, less than 5 percent of land title owners are women (Bedelian 2014: 102;

Courtney 2015: 69). It is common and accepted for men to beat their wives for being disobedient (Female Teacher 4; Trust Staff 2), and early marriage is common with some girls married soon after beginning menses and undergoing clitoral circumcision (CDW 3). These structural barriers present many challenges for women, but I argue that women are reconfiguring these relations by shifting the extent to which they may occupy economic and social spaces at camps, markets, and in towns. Hodgson's (2000) edited volume on the 'myth of the patriarchal pastoralist' convincingly argues that pastoral societies are not inherently patriarchal as is sometimes assumed, but rather they are as much a product of interactions with translocal forces and are thus not fixed concepts.

The primary objective of this research was to identify the challenges youth face in terms of attaining formal employment. One limitation I found, however, was that young women are often excluded altogether from the category of youth. If I asked about 'the youth', participants would discuss only the problems young men face until prompted to also include young women. A young girl will marry at a very young age in order for her father to acquire cattle from the husband's family, with the bride quickly becoming a married woman without children and then a mother with child-rearing (Hodgson 1999b). In contrast, young boys are not married until being circumcised and completing their age-set ceremonies in their late teens or early twenties when they become junior elders, retaining their freedom to leave the household to herd or find employment in towns (ibid). As a community development worker (CDW) told me, 'We don't have adolescent girls in Maasai community. They are either girls in school or young mothers' (CDW 2). Discursively, even in English, market women are almost always referred to as 'mamas', maintaining their primary identity as mothers, rather than businesswomen. In discussing job opportunities, I found that these gender roles and patriarchal social structures transferred onto women's abilities to attain formal employment. The societal expectations that young women would fulfil household duties and be primarily responsible for child-rearing prevented them from accessing the same opportunities as young men.

4.3 Gender and Tourist Camps

There are a growing number of Maasai women incorporated into income generating projects by development organisations and they are changing the ways in

which microeconomic activities function (Hodgson 2001: 18; Kipuri et al 2008; Wangui 2008). This trend necessitates a closer look at the ways in which this change affects gender roles within households and the broader society. By examining the effects of globalising and translocal forces – such as tourism camps, markets, and development actors – on how gender is organised and culturally constructed, we can extend our analysis into a more nuanced, thick description of existing gender norms (Broch-Due and Anderson 1999; Rasmussen 2002).

Tourism is the main industry in the Mara and presents the most readily available opportunities for both women and men to acquire employment. Women face institutional forms of discrimination from camps though, in that these spaces were literally not built for them. They also face explicit discrimination as camp managers have expressed they will not hire women because they present too big a risk. As a male guide said, ‘It is actually like [camps] are just going for men and I think that is another challenge affecting³ the women’ (Guide 1). Koiyaki Guiding School (KGS) has attempted to mitigate this disparity by empowering young women through tourism. The school reserves one-third of each yearly intake for female students. Initially, camps were reluctant to hire female guides, because they could not logistically accommodate women and they would have to construct separate housing quarters (Male Teacher 2). As tourists demanded female guides who have been ‘empowered to show them around the Mara’, camps began to provide this space, but not without difficulty (Trust CEO). In order to carve out this physical and social space for women at camps, it has required cooperation on the part of a variety of actors. However, there still remain numerous social challenges toward women actually occupying these spaces.

For jobs in the tourism industry, staff must remain at the camps and they have a limited number of days in which to travel home (Guide 1). This is generally not a problem for men, but it is for women. For women seeking employment, as important as the activities of the profession itself is whether or not the job requires one to be away from home. Many women do not return to work after becoming pregnant or taking

³ For Swahili-speakers, the English word, ‘affect’, generally has a negative connotation from its closest translation: *-athiri*.

maternity leave (Camp Staff 1; Trust CEO). As one Maasai community development worker told me,

The culture and traditions allows this man to move freely and search for jobs or casual employment, whereas it does not allow the ladies to do so, because it's perceived that the woman's job is to sit back home with the kids and do domestic errands. There's that cultural aspect that denies them that opportunity to go look for employment. The few vacancies that are available for Maasai people are for men and not women (CDW 1)

The social expectation that women are responsible for domestic labour and child-rearing prevents them from holding onto these jobs and sometimes from accessing them at all.

As a KGS teacher explained, '...you go to Hilton (in Nairobi), you'll find ladies and gentlemen. Why is it so special about here?' (Male Teacher 2). I found that many camps desired to employ women but found it too risky, because so many would leave after becoming pregnant or would try to do the lion's share of the work while men sat back (Camp Manager 3). The cultural norms guiding how women act transferred from Maasai pastoralist, patriarchal gender divisions onto capitalist modes of production in the tourism industry.

Although young, educated women have begun to push the boundaries of what is socially acceptable, they are also held back by husbands and families (Male Teacher 2). The Danish head teacher at Karen Blixen Cooking School told me of a female student who was offered a great job in Nairobi, but her family forced her to decline the offer (Camp Staff 2). Being far away home creates more opportunities for employment, but it also creates opportunities to stray from cultural norms of patriarchy, as being a mother is still a central aspect of Maasai womanhood and necessitates staying at home to provide domestic labour (Hodgson 2001).

Nicole Smith (2015) captures the fluidity and contingency of gender roles for Maasai women of Simanjaro, Tanzania and what is perceived as appropriate work. Smith compares women opening shops and entering market activities in local areas with those leaving to do the same near the gemstone mining area of Mererani. She finds that 'women's income-earning opportunities challenge men's authority and societal expectations of women as mothers and wives', disrupting and upending the gender system (Smith 2015: 307). While the women who sell goods locally feel empowered by

their new access to cash and are somewhat begrudgingly accepted within society, the women who travel to Mererani are perceived as ‘prostitutes’, having abandoned their families. Ultimately, they are disenfranchised by both men and other women.

Like the distant urban town of Mererani, tourism camps in the Mara represent zones of transition, where people of diverse ethnic, religious, and class backgrounds interact, providing opportunities to expose both men and women to alternative social practices and gender orders (Hodgson 2000). Although camps are sometimes perceived as places of prostitution and immorality (Male Teacher 2; Male University Student 2), they are also perceived as places that produce and reproduce roles for women as leaders and conservationists. Speaking of his fellow female guides, a male guide acknowledged, ‘some people believe women cannot change a tire, but they can’ (Guide 1). Tourism camps provide sites where patriarchal gender configurations are partially reproduced, but this does not detract from their ability to also be a site of contestation.

4.4 Beadwork and Market Activities

Women’s income-generating schemes pushed by development organisations follow diverse pathways and have uneven effects across communities. As Brockington (2004) demonstrates in his article on pastoralist women living near Mkomazi Game Reserve in northern Tanzania, the effects of women entering into income-generating activities are generally multiple. Women who earn their own income may experience feelings of greater power and emancipation. However, this process may also be accompanied by a withdrawal of male support to the household income, putting further burden onto women (ibid).

For the 300 Maasai women taking part in the Trust’s beadwork project, the household has become a key site of contestation in social transformations as women who earn independent incomes must struggle with their husbands to retain control over their earnings. These beadworking women are picked up from their homes and driven to the Trust’s office. They learn the colours and patterns of items needed to fill an order and, after getting the materials and instructions, they finish the remainder of their work at home. Groups of ladies come once a week on rotation to limit the number of times they are away from the home. While their work falls within the bounds of social acceptability,

even the one day a week that they were required to leave home meets with disapproval by some husbands unless the women earn enough to cover additional costs incurred for hiring a herder or house help (Trust CEO).

A similar process takes place for women engaged in market activities and self-help groups (CDW 1). For women, selling at markets and running businesses from the household is not seen as conflicting with their ability to fulfil domestic responsibilities and thus is not viewed as a problem (Female Teacher 3). As the women gain access to credit through savings groups, they are able to purchase solar lanterns and rain-harvesting tanks – labour-saving devices which reduce their need to travel long distances for firewood or water (CDW 2). A male community development worker said that men generally see their wives' microeconomic activities as positive for the family, but they also resent not being able to have the same opportunities (ibid). He expressed that it is still the man's responsibility to pay for school fees and meet daily food requirements. He said the men see even educated wives sitting back and demanding that the husband provide for them instead of working.

The women's perspective differed in that they saw women's intrinsic suitability for domestic care and household responsibilities as making them better candidates for these economic opportunities. A primary school head teacher explained that women are more 'sympathetic' and 'committed' to their families, and 'it is the mother who struggles to go sell a quart of milk for the children to have soap...because men don't think twice when it comes to money' (Female Teacher 3). These externally introduced income-earning opportunities present spaces in which gender roles and activities are contested. As development programmes aim to provide benefits to women, men try to find gains for themselves as well through a patriarchal social structure.

4.5 Political Economy of Gender and Wage Labour

The patriarchal social structure of Maasai communities causes women and men to misperceive gender relations as equal and although women could hold the same positions as men, structural limitations curb the extent to which this is actually achieved. Most participants in my research felt that young men and women face the same challenges in terms of finding employment, because both lack skills and education. For those who have

finished secondary school or university, female teachers said youth get jobs at about an even gender ratio (Female Teachers 1, 3). However, gender ratios in secondary schools are heavily skewed toward boys and even if all students who finish secondary school are viewed as equal, boys will still fill a disproportionate number of vacancies. When I visited schools and clinics, where such work would be socially acceptable for girls, only boys were given attachments as teaching assistants or nurse's aides and nearly all the permanent staff were male. One of the male teachers explained this by saying that students have about the same aspirations regardless of gender, but girls from the area barely qualify for the jobs that they want (Male Teacher 1). A political economy around employment is created as some women have hospitality certificates, but are sitting at home while other less qualified men work at camps (Trust CEO). The camp's Maasai cultural liaison chooses candidates for interviews and they prioritise the few spots for men. The social barriers that prevent girls from finishing school give them a disadvantage in finding jobs compared to boys and a pattern of marginalisation and inequality ensues.

Women were also excluded from potentially performing available wage labour jobs. I frequently heard from participants that women could do tailoring, hairdressing, cooking, teaching, nursing, or housekeeping, but rarely did anyone say women could physically perform manual or physical labour. Due to small-scale urbanization and camp construction, the skills most in demand in the area are those for carpenters, masons, electricians, plumbers, and mechanics. Although Maasai men have begun training as cooks for camps, a job that was previously thought to be 'women's work', the converse is not true (Camp Staff 2). Men would tell me that what women needed were workshops on cleanliness, sanitation and water management in order to improve their homes, or instruction on how to balance budgets for their market sales (Conservancy Manager 3; Guide 2). Their perceptions around what women should be trained for was framed around patriarchal gender roles and divisions of labour.

If the Trust chooses to pursue training programmes for the masculine-gendered skills most in demand, it is unlikely, although not impossible, that women will choose to participate because of societal expectations. In this way, opportunities are expanded for men and certain male activities are inadvertently privileged. It would make little sense, however, to provide training for skills for which there is no local market. Unless women

are given real opportunities to take part in jobs that are within social acceptability, such as teaching or nursing, change will rely on the few women willing to more directly challenge existing gender roles and social norms (Hodgson 2000).

For meaningful transformation of gendered labour practices and economic opportunities, shifts will also have to come from men. Maasai men also have diverse reactions, and not all stubbornly hold onto authority (Hodgson 2001). Some very much support their daughters, wives, and sisters in diversifying their activities, whether because it benefits the households, or because they have more egalitarian ambitions for their male and female family members. For example, I stayed in the house of Olesere village elder, Rusei Ole Soit, who has made the choice to educate all of his children. His daughter, Teriano, is currently finishing a Law degree at Nairobi University, one of the first and only Maasai girls from this area to do so. Many community development workers in the area support a more nuanced approach to gender issues that include men and boys as well. Following these perspectives, women's empowerment initiatives which are so popular amongst rural development schemes must not be limited to expanding women's income alone, but must take into account the full social and cultural context in which these activities take place, particularly if they are patriarchal (Smith 2015). Women may not be empowered through wage labour or market activities in the sense that development organisations intend if husbands then withdraw financial support to the household. By incorporating men into empowerment initiatives through increased dialogue and participation in planning, men can also feel supported without putting more burdens on women.

4.6 Conclusion

Structural inequalities in gender relations continue to persist in Maasai Mara, particularly as a result of development interventions. Smith (2015) argues livelihood diversification is accompanied by processes, and opportunities, that can both challenge and reify the existing gender system. Mainstream, economic-driven employment opportunities promoted by development organisations are a powerful form of patriarchal (re)production. However, new economic activities provide spaces, even if limited ones, for negotiation and contestation of existing gender roles and social boundaries (Wangui

2014). The Trust's training programme should take into account these patterns so that young women and girls at least have the choice to pursue whichever livelihood they may choose.

CHAPTER 5: The Political Economy of Employment

‘Our hero now looked longingly forward to the day when he should be a warrior; but meanwhile he must employ himself herding the goats and sheep. This was his first occupation’ (Thomson 1968 [1885]: 246).

In his 19th century journey through Maasailand, Thomson describes the activities of a young Maasai boy, waiting to come of age and gain authority and respect within his community, by accumulating cattle, children, and wives. For many of today’s Maasai youth in Mara, herding is still their first ‘occupation’ and their exposure to other livelihood activities is very limited. While many now desire paid employment, their affiliation with pastoralism as a livelihood and as an identity is still very strong. As described in Chapter 2, historically, Maasai came to identify themselves in opposition to other ethnic groups which pursued non-pastoral activities and the Maasai came to think of these other groups as poor (Spencer 1998). For many pastoralist people, farming, hunting, gathering, and wage labour were only pursued when one had lost all cattle (Waller 1999). These other activities were done with the hope of eventually being able to accumulate livestock and re-join pastoralism.

In this chapter, I first describe the ways in which micro- and macroeconomic factors affect the youth’s ability to acquire employment. Second, I analyse the types of desirable and undesirable work in Maasai Mara and the underlying social causes that create this differentiation. Third, I discuss the divergent attitudes regarding why youth are not currently performing manual, wage labour, which is the work in highest demand⁴. Lastly, I argue that pastoralist livelihoods diversification does not automatically engender economic security and that the Maasai of this area remain vulnerable to structural barriers and systems of dependency within new capitalist economies. New forms of work are uneasily incorporated into pastoralist social structures; the success of a skills training programme catering toward these jobs will require close attention to issues of class and identity.

⁴ I use the terms ‘manual labour’ and ‘wage labour’ interchangeably throughout the dissertation. In Maasai Mara, some manual labour is performed in exchange for food and board, while some wage labour is not considered highly physical (i.e. security guards, cleaners, hired herders). For the Trust’s objectives though, the main focus was placed on jobs which encompass both.

5.1 Structural Limitations to Employment

In the Maasai Mara, the international tourism industry has dual effects. On one hand, it provides the most employment for skilled and unskilled workers, and it offers the most opportunities for earning a high salary in Mara. On the other, it still offers only a limited number of jobs relative to the number of job-seekers and it can provide a disincentive for youth to stay in school by hiring many uneducated people for unskilled positions. For the majority, it offers short-term gains at the cost of longer-term achievements. As one young man employed at a computer centre in Talek said, the youth ‘do not see any other alternative apart from tourism, so when they do not proceed for further education, they end up working in the tourism industry’ (FG 4). The tourism industry has created a relationship of dependency that does provide means for development, but only in a limited number of ways.

National and transnational organisations have played a part in creating these conditions of dependency through donors funding projects that aim to empower people through tourism. Koiyaki Guiding School (KGS) was a school founded to empower local Maasai youth by enabling them to become educated and certified tour guides. KGS has largely been supported by Africa Impact and the European Union-supported organisation, Tusk Trust, and many of the school’s students have been sponsored by international tourists (Male Teacher 2). The first group of KGS graduates from 2008 were able to find jobs with a 100 percent success rate, but since then, each group has been less successful in finding employment. Now, recent KGS graduates are sitting at home, tired of looking for work, and current students are worried they will have the same fate (FG 2; FG 5). Turnover for tour guides is very slow and thus the 25 graduates that KGS produces every year are having increasing difficulty in finding work, especially during a tourism downturn (Conservancy Manager 1; Male Teacher 2). A teacher from KGS told me they are eager to direct some of their resources toward training youth for other jobs, but they are limited by a significant decline in funding in recent years (Male Teacher 2).

At the microeconomic level, ethnicity and kinship create a political economy of employment within the tourism enterprise and the Maasai view this phenomenon as corrupt. People have accused KGS of being biased in the selection of their students, giving slots to relatives of land committee members, an elite group (Male Adult 1). The

same is true for ranger positions at conservancies (Conservancy Managers 1, 2). This transfers benefits along generational and familial lines, rather than allowing the most qualified students to also gain access to education and skills (Male Adult 1). Many youth said that managers at tourism camps are non-Maasai Kenyans and give other ethnic groups preference in hiring. KGS students describe how getting jobs at camps hinges on having the support of conservancy landowners or having a ‘godfather’ – a term used by several well educated men to describe how youth were able to be get jobs without being qualified and keep them because they were ‘protected’ (Conservancy Manager 2; FG 5; Male Adult 1). During past high seasons, when they needed additional help, camp managers said they would just find the brother of an employee rather than trying to advertise and interview candidates (Camp Manager 3). This was for the sake of speed and simplicity (ibid). They are trying to move away from this system though by creating formal databases of all applicants for future vacancies (ibid). Both camps and conservancies realise that it is in their best interest to move away from nepotism, but it appears that local Maasai ‘brokers’ and middlemen will equally try to maintain their power and authority (Olivier de Sardans 2005).

5.2 Prosperity and Desirability of Employment

Despite the difficulty in finding work⁵, many people still view guides as prosperous (Male Village Elder 1; Male Teacher 2). As you drive through the Mara, the concrete houses with fences built around them and motor vehicles parked out front will almost always belong to guides. Such visible manifestations of wealth have made the youth very selective in terms of the jobs they desire (Male Adult 1; Male University Student 1). Many camp and conservancy managers I spoke to said that the youth were seeking only tour guide jobs, but when I spoke with the youth themselves, they said this was not the case (FG 2; FG 4). In one focus group of young men from Olesere, the majority were unemployed and had not finished primary school; however, they expressed interest in being waiters, cooks, or housekeepers in camps, or in being mechanics or carpenters (FG 2). They saw these as desirable jobs, but said they lacked the skills to

⁵ At a candidate screening for Asilia Africa camps held in Aitong, 54 applicants applied for 2 guide positions. Over 200 people applied for 10 available positions overall.

attain them (ibid). This question of whether youth lack the skills or the desire to do these jobs is one of the main points of contention amongst participants and provides the basis for section 5.3.

The research for this dissertation came at an interesting time. The camp manager at Basecamp said that the al-Shabab attacks in Garissa, (northern) Kenya, had greatly affected tourist numbers, thus trickling down to the residents (Camp Manager 1; Male Teacher 2). While some people still championed the ability of tourism to employ many residents, others were beginning to cast doubt on, or were expressing reluctance toward, tourism jobs because of the current downturn. They were also aware that the tourism industry alone is not enough to absorb all the youth who desire jobs (Guide 1; Male Adult 1).

Clinic staff and teachers in particular used this opportunity to express their desire for more students to work at schools and clinics, rather than just wanting to be a tour guide. Joseph, a private clinic owner, said, ‘Tourism cannot come to the Mara when the country is not stable. That market is very fragile. It’s not like doing nursing or doing teaching’ (Clinic Staff 1). Joseph told me many youth had come to work at the clinic, but left after several days because they did not want to work for only food (ibid). Although these jobs have security, they are perceived as low-paying and therefore undesirable. One head teacher explained that she desperately needed teachers, but the Maasai children ‘detest teaching’, because the teachers have been suffering and striking over their salaries (Female Teacher 3).

When I asked a group of secondary school students about whether they would be willing to get unpaid work experience at the new clinic in Aitong, they expressed reluctance (FG 3). Six out of 10 students in the group wanted to study medicine and yet none were enthusiastic about volunteering at a clinic. This attitude is partially created in schools where, from an early age, teachers push students toward white-collar jobs and declare that other jobs are not good enough (Trust CEO). Several well-educated men stressed to me that both parents and teachers push young people into certain career tracks because of the prestige of a title or a higher salary; however, the youth lack passion for these jobs and ultimately are unhappy and unsuccessful (Clinic Staff 1; Guide 1; Male Adult 1). The pressure to have education ‘pay off’ because of the economic sacrifices

made to send children to school and the social cost of losing labour and informal herding knowledge has largely created unrealistic expectations for students. While white-collar jobs are the most desirable, structural limitations often prevent them from being attainable.

5.3 Perceptions of Manual and Wage Labour

Jobs associated with the tourism industry are the main source of employment in the Mara. These include both salaried, contract positions as well as informal wage labour. Although Narok County is primarily populated by Maasai, camps and conservancies said that manual labour jobs – masonry, carpentry, electrics, plumbing, and mechanics – are almost never done by local Maasai. Despite the high demand for this work because of local microeconomic development, currently these jobs are being done by non-Maasai ‘outsiders’, like the Kisiis and Kalenjins from neighbouring parts of Kenya (Conservancy Manager 1; Guide 1; Guide 2). As Jackson, a community development worker said,

‘The people who are doing mechanics here, everyone comes from Nairobi or other parts of this country...Camps and lodges around here, every camp has a plumbing system, either for their sewages or their water. There is no single plumber in Talek...Everyone here has an electric line... here in this camp, whenever we have a problem with the power line, you have to find someone [from outside]’ (CDW 1).

Many people echoed these same sentiments, but they diverged as to *why* none of the local youth are currently doing these jobs. These interview conversations often became quite emotional as people felt strongly about their opinions and either defended their youth or admitted their disdain for them. The reasons given for youth not filling these positions largely fell into two broad categories: a lack of skills and familiarity with the work, or the laziness of youth and their perception that the work is poorly paid.

Many people said that the work was too physically demanding or difficult for the youth, and they were unaccustomed to it because they had only ever been herders. One afternoon I met with a non-Maasai contractor in charge of building school dormitories at Olesere. He said he had tried to employ Maasai youth before, but they always left. They initially showed interest in learning new skills, but they end up leaving, unwilling to do hard work. This observation was replicated across several Maasai sources as well (Camp Manager 1; Male Adult 2). The contractor thinks that they are used to spending all day

with livestock and are not used to working with their hands (Male Adult 2). Helen, a South African camp manager, similarly remarks that Maasai are not used to doing hard labour: 'Even if we are digging a hole, we just know now, just ask the Kalenjins or the Kisiis to do it...I don't think anyone's to blame for it. It's just not part of the culture here to do farming basically, I mean like digging furrows, planting' (Camp Manager 3).

The Trust's CEO, Crystal, disagrees that the Maasai are not used to hard work, but she said the Maasai of this area 'seem to be very particular in terms of what jobs they are and are not doing at the moment' (Trust CEO). She tells a story of how several local Maasai youth had come to help build her house a few weeks before, but after a week they were sitting off to the side and refusing to perform the duties while the other casuals⁶ did what was required (ibid). She explains that Maasai from Trans-Mara (north of the study site) or Amboseli (to the East) are able to perform these tasks, but for some reason these local Maasai youth can walk long, arduous distances with cattle, but will not dig a hole.

Other perceptions of why youth are not doing manual labour had to do with its typically low wages and the unwillingness of youth to start at an entry-level job (Camp Manager 2; Camp Manager 3; Camp Manager 4). As one Maasai camp manager told me, 'Most of the Maasai people, they think when you do something like mason, like mechanic, you are poor or you become dirty' (Camp Manager 2). A Maasai clinic owner similarly stated, 'These boys don't have any skill. They don't do any manual work. For building houses, they don't want to build, because they think the money which is being paid is very little' (Clinic Staff 1). A Somali shopkeeper mentioned that the youth were unwilling to work hard initially to reap benefits over time. He said the youth, 'don't have sufficient motivation to hold onto this work, especially if it's just a little money or they get just a little benefit'⁷ (Male Shopkeeper). Until skills training is offered, it is impossible to know with certainty whether youth are not doing these jobs because they find them undesirable or because they lack skills for these jobs. It is apparent though that for Maasai in Mara, pastoralism is the ultimate livelihood goal, and attitudes around wage labour are tentative and entry into wage labour is hesitant or even resistant.

⁶ Casuals was a term used to describe unskilled, daily or wage labourers.

⁷ My own Swahili-English translation.

Little et al's (2008) comparative study of pastoralists in northern Kenya and southern Ethiopia found that nomadic communities were relatively better off than more sedentary ones, the latter being more reliant on wage labour for cash income. The poorest households had the most diversified sources of income and although they earned higher incomes overall, they also had greater expenditures (ibid). In northern Kenya, a recent increase in stocklessness has led many to become dependent on food-for-work schemes, which require unskilled labour in towns (ibid). The association between stocklessness and unskilled labour may make other wage labour jobs less desirable for pastoralists, as these activities are closely tied to pastoral definitions of poverty.

In a few cases, Maasai men in Mara have started doing manual labour at conservancies, and managers say these are now their best employees (Conservancy Managers 2, 3). For the Maasai labourer though, this is often less by choice than out of necessity. As one manager said, 'I mean take a guy like John⁸, desperate for land. If we laid him off, he has no land. He was never allocated land. He has nowhere to go. No prospects if we lay him off. He's never gone to school. There's a guy who worked for us for three months for free until we had a position for him that he could have' (Conservancy Manager 2). John's success indicates that there are limited spaces available for upward mobility amongst the landless, uneducated, and poor Maasai, if they are willing to engage in wage labour jobs. Cases like John are not the norm in the Mara though.

Pragmatically, Richard, a conservancy manager, explained that the youth often do not see the purpose of doing manual, wage labour; they do not get any qualifications and therefore never procure salaried employment as a result (Conservancy Manager 1). He believes that the physical pain and hard work is unbearable for many without a longer-term incentive (ibid). One male youth had been employed as a casual labourer at Basecamp in 2010, where he transported and leveled wheelbarrows of slap stone, but he has not done this type of job again. He said it was a nice job for several months, but it paid very little, so he was only able to put his earnings into two sheep and food (Male Youth). Currently, he is jobless and would like to be employed as a security guard, however, he lacks any supporting documents to show to camps (ibid). All conservancy

⁸ Real name changed to protect his identity.

managers interviewed suggested a training programme that teaches youth manual labour skills and results in an official technical qualification. This would allow youth to claim higher wages upon completion. Pastoralism provides a sufficient livelihood that any diversification or diversion of labour from herding activities must yield a long-term advantage.

5.4 Pastoralism and Livelihoods Diversification

One of the central arguments of rural livelihoods diversification literature is that people are either pushed into pursuing alternative activities by situations of chronic poverty, or pulled by the opportunities to expand wealth or reduce vulnerability to shocks (Ellis 2000). For East African pastoralists, livelihood diversification often equates to sedentarisation and farming, but can also include wage labour, petty trade, and tourism payments (Homewood et al 2006; Fratkin 2013). Ellis (2000) has argued that diversifying sources of income will nearly always outweigh the disadvantages of not doing so; his specificity to farming communities does not directly transfer onto pastoral communities though. Little et al (2008) argue that in the era of globalisation, poverty reduction strategies are so closely linked to increasing cash incomes and integrating the poor into markets that they obscure the value of herd dividends and the importance of rural localities for pastoralists.

In the study of pastoralist poverty and livelihood diversification, it is important to look beyond the behavioural aspects of poverty and what the poor do to survive, and to focus on the structural causes of poverty and what makes/keeps people poor (Little et al 2008). The influence of foreign capitalist enterprises on formerly subsistence economies has been a major focus of international development literature. Tourism in Maasai Mara has the capacity to provide employment and grow the local economy, but it also deters people from pursuing higher education and inhibits them from reaching higher-wage and higher-skilled positions.

In Maasai Mara, attitudes toward non-pastoral activities are remarkably resilient and are manifest in capitalist modes of production within the tourism industry. As Maasai ethnicity and identity are still closely tied to livestock, their pastoralist definitions of poverty and wealth transfer onto certain new types of manual and wage labour work. It

remains to be seen how the myriad opportunities for manual wage labour will be incorporated into Maasai livelihood diversification strategies. These types of work might be rejected for their association with non-pastoral livelihoods or the poor may use them as a way to regain social stature vis-à-vis new forms of wealth. The outcome to this question is beyond the scope of this study, but this chapter will hopefully provide insights to help the Trust move forward with the design of their skills training programme.

CHAPTER 6 Moving Forward: Recommendations for Olare Orok and Motorogi Trust

On July 25, 2015, the Global Entrepreneurship Summit was held in Nairobi, Kenya (Mathenge 2015: 6). This event showcased organisations that train youth and women to be an ‘antidote’ to some of the world’s greatest challenges, including global poverty and rising local instability from al-Shabab (ibid). Organisations were encouraged to make their own commitments to training youth, whether that be through ‘mentorship programmes or [through] helping entrepreneurs access capital and connect to markets...’ (ibid). The goals of this international event largely paralleled what the Trust hopes to achieve in the Mara.

The Trust’s goals have enormous potential, but a variety of social factors and structural limitations need to be considered in the project’s design and implementation. In order to be successful and provide the intended effect of increased employment, new economic activities must be sufficiently compatible with pastoralist livelihood strategies. Participants simultaneously expressed a desire to remain pastoralists, but also to ‘be like anyone else, like anywhere in the world’ (Male Adult 1). The youth want to see ‘what is out there and what is possible’ in the world (CDW 2), but they want to remain Maasai (Trust CEO). They want to diversify within their culture and in ways that largely conform to their social expectations.

Given the availability of work locally, the Trust should cater skills training programmes toward creating carpenters, masons, electricians, plumbers, and mechanics. Initially, the Trust can sponsor students to attend existing vocational schools in other regions of Kenya. In the long term, however, participants expressed that a polytechnic should be constructed within Maasai Mara in order to facilitate access for local youth. At the end of the programme, youth should sit the national level exams in Narok in order to receive an official certificate for their qualification. Having a formal and standardized document allows them to earn higher salaries and ensures that their achievements will be recognised universally.

The question of whether or not youth will persevere through hard, physical work can be addressed by requiring a trial period of at least one month. Before being admitted to the programme, youth must commit to doing voluntary manual labour during this time.

Several participants expressed that the youth must be serious and committed to their work, because the non-Maasai who are currently holding these jobs are more experienced and thus the youth's skills must be competitive.

A training programme designed around manual labour or tourism camp jobs will have gendered consequences in a patriarchal society. Although it is possible that women will participate in the programme, participants seemed doubtful that women would desire these skills or be willing to work away from home. To complement the technical trainings, the Trust should consider offering support for students who wish to pursue nursing or teaching. These positions are more likely to be filled by young women and thus present opportunities to reach all genders.

Many youth expressed that they would like a form of career guidance and counseling. Hiring processes are quite unstructured and operate along ethnic or kinship lines, so the youth feel hopeless in even knowing what opportunities are available in the Mara. Counseling could particularly assist the more highly educated population of youth, helping secondary school students find work attachments or university courses that align with their interests.

Less formally educated participants stated that they would like more knowledge around upgraded livestock breeds, veterinary medicine, rangeland management, and basic business skills. As sedentarisation and land demarcation are changing the landscape, the Maasai are forced to change the ways they herd livestock. The Trust can bring in experts from various institutions to help discuss ways to improve livestock herding amidst these changing circumstances

Pastoralist livelihood strategies are often represented as 'traditional' or immutable relics, but pastoral systems are highly adaptive (Spencer 1998). In Maasai Mara, people would like to keep both their livestock and their Land Cruisers. Although tourism camps create systems of dependency, they also provide avenues for microeconomic growth. While camps and development projects (re)produce patriarchal gender norms, they also offer sites for contestation and negotiation over the division of labour and social expectations. The entry of capitalist modes of production into formerly subsistence areas has received harsh critique amongst development scholars, but these new spaces also offer opportunities for roles to be shifted and new livelihoods pursued. Amidst a rapidly

changing environment, the Trust has the potential to make a positive impact and improve the lives of the Maasai youth.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bedelian, C. (2013) Conservation and ecotourism on privatized land in the Mara, Kenya: The case of conservancy land leases. *Land Deal Politics Initiative* Working Paper 9. Available from: <http://www.plaas.org.za/sites/default/files/publications-pdf/LDPI09%20bedelian_0.pdf>. [Accessed 5 March 2015]
- Bedelian, C. (2014) Conservation, tourism, and pastoral livelihoods: Wildlife conservancies in the Maasai Mara, Kenya. *Unpublished PhD Thesis*. University College London.
- Bonte, P. and Galaty, J. (1991) Introduction. In Galaty, J. and Bonte, P. (eds.) *Herders, Warriors, and Traders: Pastoralism in Africa*. Oxford: Westview Press, 1-20.
- Broch-Due, V. and Anderson, D. (1999) Poverty & the pastoralist: Deconstructing myths, reconstructing realities. In: Anderson, D. and Broch-Due, V. (eds) *The Poor Are Not Us*. Oxford: James Currey, 3-19
- Brockington, D (2004) Women's income and livelihood strategies of dispossessed pastoralists near the Mkomazi Game Reserve, Tanzania. *Human Ecology* 29(3): 307-338
- Catley, A., Lind, J., Scoones, I. (2013) Development at the margins: pastoralism in the Horn of Africa. In: Catley, A., Lind, J., Scoones, I. (eds) *Pastoralism and Development in Africa: Dynamic Change at the Margins*. London: Routledge, 1-26
- Chatty, D. and Colchester, M. (eds) (2002) *Conservation and Mobile Indigenous Peoples: Displacement, Forced Settlement and Sustainable Development*. London: Berghahn Books.
- Courtney, C. (2015) Sustainable Africapitalism? Grassroots Perceptions of Maasai Mara Conservancies and their Relationship with Development. *Unpublished PhD Dissertation*, University of Edinburgh.
- Dahl, G. (1987) Women in pastoral production. *Ethnos: Journal of Anthropology* 52(1-2): 246-279
- Duffy, R. (2006). The politics of ecotourism and the developing world. *Journal of Ecotourism* 5(1-2) : 1-6
- Education Policy and Data Center. (2007) Narok: Kenya District Primary Education Profile. Available from: <http://www.epdc.org/sites/default/files/documents/kenya_subnatk_narok.pdf> [Accessed 12 April 2015]

- Ellis, F. (2000) The determinants of rural livelihood diversification in developing countries. *Journal of Agricultural Economics* 51(2): 289-302
- Expert Africa (2014) Map of the Maasai Mara for safaris. Available from: <<https://www.expertafrica.com/kenya/maasai-mara-national-reserve/reference-map>> [Accessed 11 August 2015]
- Fratkin, E. (2001) East African pastoralism in transition: Maasai, Boran, and Rendille cases. *African Studies Review* 44(3): 1-25
- Fratkin, E. (2013) Seeking alternative livelihoods in pastoral areas. In: Catley, A., Lind, J., Scoones, I. (eds) *Pastoralism and Development in Africa: Dynamic Change at the Margins*. London: Routledge, 197-205
- Griener, C., Sakdapolrak, P. (2013) Translocality: Concepts, applications and emerging research perspectives. *Geography Compass* 7(5): 373-384
- Hart, K. (1973) Informal income opportunities and urban employment in Ghana. *Journal of Modern African Studies* 11(1): 61-89
- Hodgson, D. (1999a) Images and interventions: the problems of pastoralist development. In: Anderson, D. and Broch-Due, V. (eds) *The Poor Are Not Us*. Oxford: James Currey, 221-239
- Hodgson, D. (1999b) "Once intrepid warriors": Modernity and the production of Maasai masculinities. *Ethnology* 38(2): 121-150
- Hodgson, D. (1999c) Women as children: Culture, political economy, and gender inequality among Kisongo Maasai. *Nomadic Peoples* 3(2): 115-130
- Hodgson, D. (2000) Gender, Culture & the Myth of the Patriarchal Pastoralist. In Hodgson, D. (ed) *Rethinking Pastoralism in Africa*. Oxford: James Currey, 1-28
- Hodgson, D. (2001) *Once Intrepid Warriors: Gender, Ethnicity and the Cultural Politics of Maasai Development*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Hodgson, D. (2011) *Being Maasai, Becoming Indigenous: Postcolonial Politics in a Neoliberal World*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Homewood, K., Coast, E., Thompson, M. (2004) In-migrants and exclusion in East African rangelands: Access, tenure and conflict. *Africa* 24(4): 567-610.
- Homewood, K., Coast, E., Kiruswa, S., Serneels, S., Thompson, M., Trench, P. (2006) Maasai pastoralists: diversification and poverty. London: LSE Research online. Available from:

- <http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/821/1/Homewood_Coast_et_al_paper.pdf> [Accessed 10 April 2015]
- Huxley, E. (1948) *The Sorcerer's Apprentice*. London: Chatto and Windus.
- Kenya Central Bureau of Statistics (2003) Geographic dimensions of well-being in Kenya: Where are the poor? From districts to locations. Regal Press Kenya, Ltd., Nairobi, Kenya. Available from:
<<http://econ.worldbank.org/external/default/main?theSitePK=477894&contentMDK=20382755&menuPK=545573&pagePK=64168182&piPK=64168060>> [Accessed 4 August 2015]
- Kipuri, N. Ridgewell, A. (2008) A double bind: the exclusion of pastoralist women in the East and Horn of Africa. *Minority Rights Group International*. Available from:
<<http://www.minorityrights.org/download.php?id=593>> [Accessed 1 May 2015]
- Lamprey, R., Reid, R. (2004) Expansion of human settlement in Kenya's Maasai Mara: what future for pastoralism and wildlife? *Journal of Biogeography* 31: 997-1032.
- Little, P., McPeak, J., Barrett, C., Kristjanson, P. (2008) Challenging orthodoxies: Understanding poverty in pastoral areas of East Africa. *Development and Change* 39(4): 587-611.
- Livingstone, J., Ruhindi, E. (2013) Women and economic diversification in pastoralist societies. In Catley, A., Lind, J., Scoones, I. (eds) *Pastoralism and Development in Africa: Dynamic Change at the Margins*. London: Routledge.
- Manyara, G., Jones, E. (2007) Community-based tourism enterprises development in Kenya: An exploration of the potential as avenues of poverty reduction. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 15(6): 628-644.
- Mara Lion Project (2015) Quarterly Report on 01 April 2015 – 30 June 2015. [Accessed 16 July 2015]
- Mathenge, O. (13 May 2015) Obama says Kenya trip a boost for youth. *The Star*. [Print]
- Mohanty, C.T. (2003) *Feminism Without Borders: Decolonizing Theory, Practicing Solidarity*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Morris, H. (2015) Kenya visitor numbers fall 25 per cent as terrorism hits tourism. *Telegraph*. Available from:
<<http://www.telegraph.co.uk/travel/destinations/africaandindianocean/kenya/11669880/Kenya-visitor-numbers-fall-25-per-cent-as-terrorism-hits-tourism.html>> [Accessed 5 August 2015]
- Mwangi, E. (2006). The footprints of history: Path dependence in the transformation of

- property rights in Kenya's Maasailand. *Journal of Institutional Economics* 2(2): 157-180.
- Neumann, R. (1998) *Imposing Wilderness: Struggles Over Livelihood and Nature Preservation in Africa*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Olivier de Sardan, J.-P. (2005) *Anthropology and Development: Understanding Contemporary Social Change*. London: Zed Books.
- Rasmussen, S. (2002) Tuareg labor migration, gendered spaces, and the predicament of women. *City & Society* 14(2): 282-311.
- Schroeder, R. (2000) Producing nature and poverty in Africa: Continuity and change. In Broch-Due, V, Schroeder, R. (eds) *Producing Nature and Poverty in Africa*. Stockholm: Nordiska Afrikainstitutet.
- Sifuna, D. (2007) The challenge of increasing access and improving quality: An analysis of universal primary education interventions in Kenya and Tanzania since the 1970s. *International Review of Education* 53(5-6): 687-699
- Smith, N. (2015) Gender and livelihood diversification: Maasai women's market activities in northern Tanzania. *Journal of Development Studies* 51(3): 305-318.
- Spear, T. (1993) Introduction. In *Being Maasai: Ethnicity and Identity in East Africa* (eds) Spear, T. and Waller, R. Oxford: James Currey Ltd.
- Spencer, P. (1998) *The Pastoral Continuum: The Marginalization of Tradition in East Africa*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Talle, A. (1987) Women as heads of houses: The organization of production and the role of women among Pastoral Maasai in Kenya. *Ethnos: Journal of Anthropology* 52(1-2): 50-80.
- Talle, A. (1988) *Women at a Loss: Changes in Maasai Pastoralism and their Effects on Gender Relations*. Stockholm Studies in Social Anthropology, vol 19. Stockholm: University of Stockholm.
- Thompson, D., Homewood, K. (2002) Entrepreneurs, elites, and exclusion in Maasailand: Trends in wildlife conservation and pastoralist development. *Human Ecology* 30(1): 107-138
- Thompson, D., Serneels, S., Kaelo, D., Trench, P. (2009) In: Homewood, K., Kristjanson, P., Trench, P.C. (eds.) (2009) In: *Staying Maasai? Livelihoods, Conservation and Development in East African Rangelands*. New York: Springer Science, 77-114

- Thomson, J. (1968) *Through Masai Land: A Journey of Exploration Among the Snowclad Volcanic Mountains and Strange Tribes of Eastern Equatorial Africa*. 3rd ed. London: Frank Cass & Co Ltd.
- UNDP. (2014) Sustaining human progress: Reducing vulnerabilities and building resilience. Explanatory note on the 2014 Human Development Report composite indices – Kenya. Available from: <http://hdr.undp.org/sites/all/themes/hdr_theme/country-notes/KEN.pdf> [Accessed 10 May 2015]
- Waller, R.D. (1999) Pastoral poverty in historical perspective. In: Broch-Due, V. and Anderson, D.M. (eds) *The Poor Are Not Us: Poverty and Pastoralism in East African Studies*. Oxford: James Currey, 20-49.
- Wangui E.E. (2008) Development interventions, changing livelihoods, and the making of female Maasai pastoralists. *Agricultural Human Values* 25: 365-378.
- Wangui, E.E. (2014) Livelihood shifts and gender performances: Space and the negotiation of labor among East Africa's pastoralists. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 104(5): 1068-1081.
- Whitman, E. (6 April 2015) Kenya Garissa College attack: Tourists back away after al-Shabab militants kill 148 at University. *International Business Times*. Available from: <<http://www.ibtimes.com/kenya-garissa-college-attack-tourists-back-away-after-al-shabab-militants-kill-148-1870542>> [Accessed 31 July 2015]

APPENDIX A Individual Interviews Cited in Text

Participant	Date Interviewed	Gender
Camp Manager 1	6 May 2015	Male
Camp Manager 2	9 June 2015	Male
Camp Manager 3	11 June 2015	Female
Camp Manager 4	11 June 2015	Male
Camp Staff 1	18 May 2015	Male
Camp Staff 2	16 June 2015	Male
Clinic Staff 1	5 May 2015	Male
Clinic Staff 2	22 May 2015	Male
Clinic Staff 3	25 May 2015	Male
Community Development Worker (CDW) 1	6 May 2015	Male
CDW 2	6 May 2015	Male
CDW 3	16 June 2015	Female
Conservancy Manager 1	2 June 2015	Male
Conservancy Manager 2	16 June 2015	Male
Conservancy Manager 3	16 June 2015	Male
Female Teacher 1	7 May 2015	Female
Female Teacher 2	13 May 2015	Female
Female Teacher 3	28 May 2015	Female
Guide 1	4 May 2015	Male
Guide 2	11 May 2015	Male
Male Adult 1	5 May 2015	Male
Male Adult 2	9 May 2015	Male
Male Shopkeeper	18 June 2015	Male
Male Youth	11 May 2015	Male
Male Teacher 1	15 May 2015	Male
Male Teacher 2	23 June 2015	Male
Male University Student 1	5 May 2015	Male
Male University Student 2	19 May 2015	Male
Trust CEO	17 June 2015	Female
Male Village Elder	4 May 2015	Male

APPENDIX B Focus Group Discussions

Focus Group	Date	Location	Number of Participants	Gender Ratio
FG 1	11 May 2015	Mbitin	9	3F: 6M
FG 2	19 May 2015	Olesere	11	10M
FG 3	22 May 2015	Aitong	10	5F: 5M
FG 4	26 May 2015	Talek	10	2F: 8M
FG 5	23 June 2015	Naboisho	14	4F: 10M